



Clinical Decision Making Under Severe Uncertainty

§ Strategy in Patient-Physician decision:

- Involve patient in decision process.
- Provide professional advice and guidance.
- **Manage info-gaps.**

§ The problems of uncertainty:

- Design or decide.
- Robustness to noise and info-gaps.
- Opportuneness: exploit windfall.
- Satisfice or optimize.

§ Information-gap uncertainty:

- Uncertainty is a limitation of knowledge.
- Uncertainty is a gap between what is known and what could be known.
- Surprises and ignorance.

§ Models: • Characterize reality. • Attributes of model correspond to attributes of reality.

§ Model-based decision: adapt decision to attributes of model.

§ Optimal model-based decision: Use best model to choose decision with best outcome.

§ Fallacy of optimal model-based decision:

- Severe uncertainty:
- Best model errs seriously. ○ Some model attributes are **correct**. ○ Some model attributes **err greatly**.
- Best-model optimization:
- Exploits **all model attributes** to the extreme. ○ Vulnerable to model error.

§ Resolution: robust-satisficing

- Trade performance for robustness.
- Satisfice performance. • Optimize robustness to uncertainty.

§ Robust-satisficing syllogism:

- Adequate performance must be attained.
- High reliability of adequate performance preferred over Low reliability of optimal performance.
- Max reliability of adequate performance is best.

§ Trade-off: • Robustness vs. performance. • Pareto efficiency.

§ Preference reversal: crossing of robustness curves.

§ Opportune windfalling: • Facilitate wonderful outcome. • Antagonistic or sympathetic to robustness.

References:

- Yakov Ben-Haim, 2001, *Information-gap Decision Theory: Decisions Under Severe Uncertainty*, Academic Press, San Diego.
- Yakov Ben-Haim, 2004, Uncertainty, probability and information-gaps, *Reliability Engineering and System Safety*, 85: 249–266.
- Yakov Ben-Haim, 2005, Info-gap Decision Theory For Engineering Design. Or: Why ‘Good’ is Preferable to ‘Best’, chapter 11 in *Engineering Design Reliability Handbook*, Edited by E. Nikolaides, D. Ghiocel and Surendra Singhal, CRC Press.
- Yohay Carmel and Yakov Ben-Haim, Info-gap robust-satisficing model of foraging behavior: Do foragers optimize or satisfice?, *American Naturalist*, to appear.
- Helen M. Regan, Yakov Ben-Haim, Bill Langford, Will G. Wilson, Per Lundberg, Sandy J. Andelman, Mark A. Burgman, Robust decision making under severe uncertainty for conservation management, *Ecological Applications*, vol.15(4): 1471–1477.